

**THE BOARD OF EDUCATION OF
YOUNGSTOWN CITY SCHOOL DISTRICT
YOUNGSTOWN, OHIO**

20 West Wood Street

April 10, 2017

The Youngstown Board of Education met in special work session at the I.L. Ward Building on April 10, 2017. The meeting was called to order at 5:30 p.m. by President Brenda Kimble. The meeting opened with the Pledge of Allegiance followed by a moment of silence.

Roll call was taken with the following board members in attendance:

Members present: Williams, Adair, Hunter, Kimble, Murphy, Sanderson, Shadd
Members absent: None

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Motion by Mr. Murphy and seconded by Mr. Shadd to approve the agenda.

Discussion:

Mr. Hunter stated that he felt the meeting was unnecessary and a waste taxpayers funds. Because he felt the two resolutions could have been put on the regular meeting being held by the board on Tuesday, the next day. Mr. Hunter stated when you call a special meeting there should be some sense of urgency for something that needs to be dealt with right now. He did not feel like the two resolutions had an urgent purpose. He went on to say there are things that you could call a special meeting for scores, violence in the district and transportation, but this meeting should not be happening

Ms. Adair said her only concern was there are so many things that need to be discussed such as special education and finances and they should have been on the agenda. She also said she found the two amendments to be distressing but that would be up for debate.

Mr. Williams stated that previously the board had a meeting when the resolution was presented but it was not marked draft. The board said they needed time to go over it and consider the resolution because they felt that it had been pushed on them and not broken down for board members to discuss and come up with an agreeable way to run the meetings. All the board members, as a group, voted to have a special meeting. Mr. Williams said we have to take time to come together and agree on how we are going to conduct the meetings.

Mr. Shadd said the only thing that comes to mind is 8 1/2 hours that we spent on issues that could have been resolved in minutes. He also stated that he was not in agreement with removing these items when they had previously been presented and said he thought it was about time that the board revisits these items. Mr. Shadd noted that committees need to understand that they work for the good of the whole board. He said the board needed to review the resolution to understand what is required from the chair of the committee and the members of those committees.

Roll call for approval of the agenda:

Yeas: Williams, Adair, Kimble, Murphy, Sanderson, Shadd

Nays: Hunter

Motion passed.

Ms. Kimble then addressed the members to let them know the resolutions were marked draft, they can be changed if you see something you want removed or added.

RESOLUTION TO AMEND BY-LAWS OF THE BOARD OF EDUCATION TO ADD SECTION 0165.0 A, B, C & D

Ms. Kimble asked the board to begin the conversation for the first resolution.

Ms. Sanderson felt that A, B and C should be removed from the resolution because it was taken care of in D. It was a motion she made before to make meetings 2 hours long regardless of whether it was a regular or special meeting. Anything not completed at the end of the meeting would be moved to unfinished business or the meeting could be recessed. She stated that Roberts Rules takes care of most of the questions and ideas for this resolution.

Mr. Williams said if the goal is to accomplish something then we need to get to a point where we make a decision when debate stops. Mr. Williams said if we do not have any time limits we will constantly debate for 2 hours and never get anything done.

Ms. Adair then asked everyone at the table if they understood the word filibuster and explained when debate stops. Mr. Williams said if each person speaks for 10 minutes then we are over the 2 hours and we have not met our goal to accomplish something. After some discussion about suspending the rules or voting Ms. Kimble asked for a vote.

It was motioned by Mr. Murphy and seconded by Mr. Williams to approve Resolution 04-10-17-01, TO AMEND BY-LAWS OF THE BOARD OF EDUCATION TO ADD SECTION 0165.0, A, B, C, & D.

Discussion:

Mr. Hunter said he felt we were looking at the symptoms and not the root cause of the illness. People mentioned that they would prefer meetings to be shorter and speeches to be shorter, but when people do speak those opinions are not listened to, generally are not understood nor respected. He said he was not the only board member that felt this way. Mr. Hunter was not in agreement with the time limits for 3 minutes per speaker and felt the 1 minute was being used to just shut members up. He felt they could not be effective with these limits when all the board has left is its speaking voice.

Ms. Adair asked the board if they wanted to deal with each section one item at a time or in total. Ms. Kimble said in total because that was the vote that was on the floor. Ms. Adair did not understand the rationale for this change at this time. She wanted to know, where do you limit debate in government. Ms. Adair also said that prior committees did not make reports but they should have done so. Ms. Adair said the 8 ½ hours keeps coming up but in her opinion those hours were well spent because the public, the media, the staff heard very clearly were most of the

members stood on who they wanted for leadership of this organization and to limit the debate is undemocratic.

Ms. Sanderson said by limiting our voice and our opinion this just proves to the public that the board is useless, ineffective, has nothing to say and are not taking time to use a thought process. By shortening the time to debate important issues she felt the board was dissolving themselves.

Mr. Murphy said he felt 3 minutes was plenty of time and said that most other board members he has spoken with only have 2 minutes each. He said most of the public he spoke to about the 8 ½ hours thought it was ridiculous and so did most of the people in attendance.

Mr. Shadd said to get back on task Ms. Sanderson asked that we remove A, B, and C. He said he agrees with B because when we present a motion there should be no statement. He said he hears the statements about needing further time for discussion on important issues and he agrees that Roberts Rules and the bylaws gives the board the power to discuss anything at length through the democratic process. Mr. Shadd felt with the rules that were listed in the resolution the board would be able to expediently discuss the issues that are impacting the board.

Ms. Sanderson stated everyone has to be respectful of each other when speaking and if we are making changes about following rules then everyone needs to follow the rules from the president of the board to the treasurer.

Ms. Adair said that limiting debate does not mean that anyone would be more efficient or effective. Ms. Adair said why would we bother to meet if we are limiting the time to speak. Ms. Adair said the board really does not have a lot to talk about since they have no power but she would still continue to bring up her issues. All board members need to be listened to in order for board members to make an informed decision. Ms. Adair said historically when she has requested extension for debate or to get a motion tabled the board has said no. To limit your ability to speak as an elected official is undemocratic.

Mr. Williams said the proposal was 3 minutes versus 10 minutes, so how about someone proposing something in the middle. Mr. Williams said as a board we have to compromise, but you have to be sincere.

Mr. Hunter then called point of order to the chair to ask Mr. Williams was he asking for an amendment to the resolution. Mr. Williams said no because he did not want another half-hour of discussion. He just wants the board members to think about the conversation and come to some conclusion.

Ms. Kimble said this resolution is just for debate on a a motion. Mr. Shadd then said we should alter C and Mr. Murphy agreed. Ms. Adair suggested a committee work on this resolution and then bring back their suggestions. Ms. Kimble said everyone has spoken twice so what are we doing now and Mr. Murphy said there is a motion on the floor that needs to go through. Mr. Murphy said he would amend the motion to take out the sentence about board members comments. Ms. Adair then said she would offer an auxiliary amendment to deal with Mr. Williams's suggestion that we compromise with some number on the time that would be palatable to all members seated around the table. Ms. Adair suggested 7 minutes, Mr. Williams suggested 6 minutes, Mr. Murphy and Ms. Kimble suggested 5 minutes for debate on the motion. Mr. Shadd said he liked the three minutes but he was willing to let each person have three times

to speak. Everyone except Mr. Hunter was alright with 3 minutes, but Mr. Hunter was not in agreement with limiting the times to speak for any reason.

There was some conversation about board members speaking during the public participation. Mr. Shadd then suggested we add a line that board members cannot speak during public participation. Mr. Sanderson said that if there is no rule then the assumption is board members can speak during public participation. Mr. Shadd proposed that the board add a line to the resolution stating that board members shall not participate with the public participation portion of any meeting which would be valid for comment from what a community member says and for any board member to use that time for more time to speak. After some conversation on the correct wording and whether this was being added as letter E or an addition to letter C, it was determined that it would be added as a new sentence to C.

Mr. Murphy read the final version: Further, each Board member shall be limited to not more than three (3) minutes in speaking once to any other matter, or during any category of the meeting Agenda, whether under Committee reports, as examples, or otherwise. Board members shall not participate during public participation at board meetings. The letter A was also changed that board members are allowed to make up to (3) speeches. Ms. Adair took issue with the 1 minute in letter B and she said she would not compromise on one minute, but the board took a pll on the change and the majority of the board wanted to keep B as written.

It was motioned by Mr. Murphy and seconded by Mr. Shadd to approve Resolution to Amend By-Laws of the Board of Education to Add Section 0165, A, B, C & D with the changes to A being in the first sentence "make up to three (3) speeches". Section C, take out board member comments and public participation and adding board members shall not participate in public comment at board meetings.

Roll call for the motion was as follows:

Yeas: Williams, Kimble, Murphy, Shadd

Nays: Adair, Hunter, Sanderson

Motion passed

It was motioned by Mr. Murphy and seconded by Mr. Shadd to extend the meeting.

Discussion:

Ms. Adair said we will either uniformly apply the bylaws or not because she remembers when she requested an extension and was denied.

Roll call for the motion was as follows:

Yeas: Williams, Kimble, Murphy, Sanderson, Shadd

Nays: Adair

Abstain: Hunter

Motion passed.

RESOLUTION TO AMEND BY-LAWS FO THE BOARD OF EDUCATION TO ADD G, H, I & J TO SECTION 0155.0.

It was motioned by Mr. Murphy and seconded by Mr. Shadd to approve Resolution #04-10-17-02 to Amend By-Laws Of The Board Of Education To Add G, H, I & J to Section 0155.

Two members needed to leave the meeting so there was a short break upon their return the president called the meeting back to order.

Ms. Adair talked about the length of time for the committees and asked what did it matter for letter I, she was okay on letter J, but Mr. Shadd stated that# 7 should say adjourned and not agenda.

Ms. Sanderson asked wasn't G already in policy? Ms. Kimble said these are new for the board because these are for the new committees, the old committees do not exist.

Mr. Murphy said he would agree to change the time for committee meetings to (2) hours. Ms. Kimble felt that this would be enough time to take care of the business. Mr. Hunter felt the time limits were not needed because if you need to leave the meeting you would be able to leave. Mr. Williams felt that this would be a long period of time in one day for the Superintendent or Treasurer. Mr. Adair thought this was a moot issue because when people need to leave a board meeting that can go and the same would be for a committee meeting. She said I needed to be stricken. Mr. Hunter said there is no other time outside of these meetings where members can talk about issues without violating the sunshine law.

Mr. Hunter said it is wrong to put any limit on the committee meeting time. Mr. Hunter said he would not serve on a committee with these limits and felt the letter I should be stricken completely.

The members continued to discuss their opinions regarding committees and work sessions from 8:00 pm to 8:40 pm.

Mr. Williams then said he wanted to make a motion that the resolution be tabled for 30 or 60 days and proceed with the committees. This will allow the members to see where the committees are headed and what is needed. Mr. Murphy withdrew his motion to vote on the resolution #04-10-17-02 to Amend By-Laws Of The Board Of Education To Add G, H, I & J to Section 0155.

It was motioned by Mr. Murphy and seconded by Ms. Sanderson for committees to start their work and revisit resolution #04-10-17-02 in 60 days.

Discussion:

Mr. Shadd felt they should move forward with the resolution , remove "I" then come back and discuss that in 60 days. Ms. Adair said these are new by-laws for the committees and agreed that the resolution should be voted on and exclude "I" for 60 days.

Mr. Shadd then amended the motion and Mr. Williams seconded that the board Finance, CEO and HB70 committees begin their work and to adopt resolution #04-10-17.02 to Amend By-

Laws Of The Board Of Education To Add G, H, exclude I & J with correction to J from agenda to adjournment to Section 0155.

On roll call vote the results were as follows:

Ayes: Williams Kimble, Murphy, Sanderson, Shadd

Nays: Hunter

Abstain: Adair, Sanderson

Motion passed

Mr. Murphy then said he was withdrawing his previous motion.

It was motioned by Mr. Williams and seconded by Mr. Shadd to adjourn. All members were in favor.

Meeting adjourned at 8:45 p.m.

President

Treasurer